

COMMENT ON OBJECTIONS

The Federal Redistribution 2009
NSW



Comment on Objections Number 23

by

**Mark Neeham, State Director, Liberal Party of Australia (New
South Wales Division)**

11 Pages

Federal Redistribution 2009

COMMENTS on OBJECTIONS

Redistribution Of Federal Electoral Boundaries

The Liberal Party of Australia (NSW Division)

September 2009



September 18, 2009

The Redistribution Committee for New South Wales
Level 4, Roden Cutler House
24 Campbell Street
SYDNEY NSW 2000

Dear Committee Members,

It is my pleasure to submit Comments on Objections on behalf of the Liberal Party of Australia (New South Wales Division).

I would like to express our appreciation to the staff of the Australian Electoral Commission for the assistance they have provided throughout the redistribution process.

If you require any further information relating to our suggestions or comments, please don't hesitate to contact me on (02) 8356 0300.

Yours sincerely,



Mark Neeham
State Director

LIBERAL PARTY OF AUSTRALIA, NEW SOUTH WALES DIVISION

COMMENTS ON OBJECTIONS TO PROPOSED REDISTRIBUTION

1. INTRODUCTION

1.1 The Liberal Party of Australia, New South Wales Division (the "Liberal Party") comments as follows on the various objections received by the Redistribution Committee for New South Wales.

2. GILMORE/THROSBY

2.1 The Liberal Party objection is supported directly or indirectly by the following community objections:

- (a) Objection #28 - Southern Highlands Business Chamber Inc.
- (b) Objection #53 - Moss Vale Chamber of Commerce Inc.
- (c) Objection #146 - Shoalhaven Business Chamber.
- (d) Objections #39, 67-70, 82, 166, 190-276 - various locals.

3. PATERSON/NEWCASTLE/LYNE

3.1 The Liberal Party objection is supported directly or indirectly by the following community objections:

- (a) Objection #94 - Hilton R Grugeon AM and B C Grugeon.
- (b) Objection #113 - M Williams, Owner Manager, Banksia Grove Village.
- (c) Objection #114 - Warren and June Monkley.
- (d) Objection #142 - Millers Forest Progress Association Inc.
- (e) Objection #143 - Gloria Green JP.
- (f) Objection #144 - Gloria Green JP, Millers Forest/Duckenfield Rural Watch and petition signed by 195 people.
- (g) Objection #171 - The Fishing Party.
- (h) Objection #182 - Port Stephens Council.

4. LABOR GENERALLY

- 4.1 The Redistribution Committee can ignore the first 2½ pages of Labor's objections. They consist of nothing more than an offensive diatribe that offers no concrete alternative.

5. LABOR OBJECTION #1 – MACARTHUR/HUME/WERRIWA

- 5.1 The Redistribution Committee should reject Labor's proposals.

Austral

- 5.2 Labor's argument that Austral shares communities of interest with other "semi-rural" areas is misconceived. 6,700 lots are to be released in Austral, as part of the South West Growth Area¹. Austral's densities and landscape will have more in common with new urban areas in Werriwa like West Hoxton Park. Austral will be "a mixed-use vibrant town"².
- 5.3 Austral has much better public transport links with the regional centre of Liverpool than with the regional centre of Campbelltown. Austral also has much better public transport links with a Werriwa electorate office in Ingleburn than with a Macarthur electorate office in Camden³:
- (a) Austral to Liverpool - between 7am and 7pm weekdays there are 7 services daily. Travel times vary from 53 minutes to 1 hour 14 minutes and vary between one and two bus services.
 - (b) Austral to Campbelltown - between 7am and 7pm weekdays there are 7 services daily. Travel times range from approximately 1 hour 26 minutes to 1 hour 57 minutes, taking commuters 1 bus and 1 train to complete the journey.
 - (c) Austral to Ingleburn - between 7am and 7pm weekdays there are 7 services daily. Travel times range from 1 hour 8 minutes to 1 hour 46 minutes, taking 1 bus and 1 train to complete the journey.
 - (d) Austral to Camden - between 7am and 7pm weekdays there are 7 services daily. Travel times range from 1 hour 35 minutes (with a

¹ <http://www.growthcentres.nsw.gov.au/newrelease-91.html>

² http://www.metrostrategy.nsw.gov.au/dev/uploads/SW-Section4_Austral.pdf

³ www.131500.com.au

commuter needing to catch 3 buses to complete the trip) to 3 hours (with 2 buses and 1 train).

5.4 Austral is a bit closer by car to Liverpool and Ingleburn than to Campbelltown or Camden⁴:

- (a) Austral to Liverpool – 15km; 26 minutes.
- (b) Austral to Ingleburn – 19km; 29 minutes.
- (c) Austral to Camden – 20km; 31 minutes.
- (d) Austral to Campbelltown – 22km; 35 minutes.

5.5 The nearest hospital to Austral is Liverpool Hospital.

Wollondilly LGA

5.6 The Redistribution Committee's proposed treatment of Wollondilly LGA makes sense. Those parts of Wollondilly LGA which the committee proposes be placed in Macarthur have a closer community of interest with Camden than with Picton (let alone with Goulburn).

5.7 The following figures from Google Maps⁵ demonstrate that:

- (a) those parts of Wollondilly LGA which Labor wants in Hume are overwhelmingly closer to a Macarthur electorate office in Camden than to a Hume electorate office in Goulburn, and
- (b) those parts of Wollondilly LGA which Labor wants in Hume are generally significantly closer to Camden and even Campbelltown than to Wollondilly LGA's centre in Picton.

| Travel by road to/from | Campbelltown | Camden | Picton | Goulburn |
|------------------------|-------------------|-------------------|-------------------|-----------------------|
| Theresa Park | 21 km; 38 mins | 10 km; 18 mins | 31 km; 43 mins | 156 km; 2h 16 mins |
| Brownlow Hill | 20 km; 36 mins | 6 km; 12 mins | 27 km; 37 mins | 155 km; 2h 14 mins |
| Orangeville | 28 km; 49 mins | 15 km; 25 mins | 31 km; 36 mins | 155 km; 2h 16 mins |

⁴ <http://maps.google.com.au>

⁵ <http://maps.google.com.au>

| | | | | |
|-------------|-------------------|-------------------|-------------------|-----------------------|
| Camden Park | 17 km; 31 mins | 6 km; 15 mins | 22 km; 27 mins | 139 km; 2 h 2 mins |
| Menangle | 11 km; 17 mins | 13 km; 22 mins | 19 km; 20 mins | 134 km; 1h 48 mins |
| Appin | 16 km; 22 mins | 27 km; 40 mins | 24 km; 23 mins | 130 km; 1h 44 mins |

- 5.8 Theresa Park, Brownlow Hill and Orangeville are on Busways route 32 to Camden⁶. Menangle is on Busways route 47 to Camden⁷.
- 5.9 Theresa Park, Brownlow Hill, Orangeville, Camden Park, Menangle and Appin are not served by Picton Buslines⁸. To travel to Picton by public transport, residents of Theresa Park, Brownlow Hill and Orangeville would have to catch a bus to Camden, then a bus to Campbelltown and then a train to Picton⁹. To travel to a Hume electorate office in Goulburn, residents of Theresa Park, Brownlow Hill and Orangeville would have to catch a bus to Camden, then a bus to Campbelltown and then two trains (or one Countrylink train¹⁰) to Goulburn¹¹.
- 5.10 The nearest general hospital to Theresa Park, Brownlow Hill, Orangeville and Camden Park is Camden Hospital in Camden, then Campbelltown Hospital in Campbelltown¹². The nearest general hospital to Menangle and Appin is Campbelltown Hospital, then Camden Hospital¹³. The next nearest generally hospital to Theresa Park, Brownlow Hill, Orangeville, Camden Park, Menangle and Appin is then Liverpool Hospital¹⁴.
- 5.11 Theresa Park, Brownlow Hill, Orangeville, Camden Park, Menangle and Appin all fall within the Camden Local Area Command of the NSW Police Force¹⁵.

⁶ <http://www.busways.com.au/files/maps/CamdenCountryNetwork180808.pdf>

⁷ <http://www.busways.com.au/files/maps/CamdenCountryNetwork180808.pdf>

⁸ http://www.buslinesgroup.com.au/picton/public_timetables.php

⁹ www.131500.com.au

¹⁰ <http://www.countrylink.info>

¹¹ www.131500.com.au

¹² <http://www.sswahs.nsw.gov.au/pdf/SSWAHSHospFac.pdf>; leaving aside Carrington Centennial Hospital in Camden

¹³ <http://www.sswahs.nsw.gov.au/pdf/SSWAHSHospFac.pdf>

¹⁴ <http://www.sswahs.nsw.gov.au/pdf/SSWAHSHospFac.pdf>

¹⁵ www.police.nsw.gov.au

6. LABOR OBJECTION #2 – EDEN-MONARO/HUME

6.1 The true reason for Labor's proposal has nothing to do with community of interest.

6.2 The current member for Eden-Monaro, Dr Mike Kelly, "let the cat out of the bag". On 13 August 2009 *The Monaro Post* reported as follows¹⁶:

"Dr Kelly would like to see a further change to the proposed redistribution, with the top end of Palerang Shire Council, which is now in Hume electorate being placed in Eden-Monaro.

Dr Kelly said another consideration was that an electorate required a population of 30,000 to entitle it to a second office.

Under the redistribution, Eden-Monaro would have only 29,499. By adding the extra part of Palerang, this could put the figure at 30,000, guaranteeing the second office and staff remain."

The reference to "a population of 30,000" was presumably meant to be a reference to an area of 30,000 km². (See February 2009 edition of *Senators and Members Entitlements 2007* page 29 – members representing electorates greater than 30,000 km² in size are entitled to have a second electorate office at taxpayer expense.)

6.3 Having a second electorate office is not a relevant criterion listed in section 73(4) of the *Commonwealth Electoral Act*.

6.4 In the absence of a legally relevant matter upon which to rely, Labor has instead advanced spurious community of interest arguments.

6.5 CCD 170505 only takes in half of the locality of Bywong.

6.6 Labor's proposal would separate (part only of) the Bywong locality from the adjacent Womboin locality by bizarrely shaped boundaries at the northern end of Eden-Monaro.

6.7 While Bywong is closer to the existing Eden Monaro electorate office in Queanbeyan than it is to the existing Hume electorate office in Goulburn, the same is not true of Currawang. Currawang is closer to Goulburn than to Queanbeyan. In any event it is not the case that people in Bywong have 70 kilometres further to travel to Goulburn than to Queanbeyan

¹⁶ <http://www.monaropost.com.au/ThreadView.aspx?tid=21260>

(contrary to the gross exaggeration in section 2 of Labor's objections). Instead Google Maps reveals the following¹⁷:

- (a) Currawang to Goulburn – 43km; 47 minutes.
- (b) Currawang to Queanbeyan - 67km; 1 hour.
- (c) Bywong to Goulburn – 67km; 56 minutes.
- (d) Bywong to Queanbeyan - 34km; 30 minutes.

6.8 Currawang shares the 2580 postcode with Goulburn.

6.9 Palerang LGA will still be split under Labor's proposal.

6.10 Apart from Labor's objection, none of the other objections which the Redistribution Committee has received contains any community protests about having Bungendore on the other hand and Bywong and/or Currawong on the other hand in separate electorates.

6.11 The Redistribution Committee's proposal is superior to Labor's insofar as the committee's proposal leaves unchanged the existing boundary between Gilmore and Hume.

7. NATIONALS OBJECTION #1 - CALARE/PARKES

7.1 The Liberal Party supports the Nationals' objection to the boundary between Calare and Parkes.

7.2 The Nationals propose a far more logical outcome. In particular:

- (a) The towns of Forbes and Parkes have a much closer relationship with Orange (in Calare) than Dubbo (in Parkes).
- (b) Mid-Western Regional LGA has a closer relationship with Dubbo than with Orange.
- (c) The Nationals' proposal avoids splitting the Wellington LGA.

¹⁷ <http://maps.google.com.au>

8. NATIONALS OBJECTION #2 – GILMORE/THROSBY

- 8.1 The Nationals appear to propose a boundary between Throsby and Gilmore which is identical or substantially identical with that proposed by the Liberal Party. The Liberal Party agrees with the additional submissions made by the Nationals.

9. NATIONALS OBJECTION #3 - HUME/MACARTHUR

- 9.1 The Liberal Party opposes the suggestions made by the Nationals for the boundary between these Divisions. See section 5 above.

10. NATIONALS OBJECTION #4 - MACARTHUR/WERRIWA

- 10.1 The Liberal Party opposes the suggestions made by the Nationals for boundary between these Divisions.
- 10.2 If Divisions are to be kept within permissible ranges of numbers, then the Redistribution Committee could not adopt at the same time both:
- (a) the Nationals' suggestions for Macarthur/Werriwa on the one hand, and
 - (b) the Liberal Party's suggestions for Fowler/Werriwa/Hughes/Cook on the other hand.

This is because Werriwa would become too large. On the projection date Werriwa would have an enrolment of 103,084.

- 10.3 Even if (wrongly) the committee considered that there were some advantages to the Nationals' proposal for Macarthur/Werriwa, any such advantages are more than outweighed by the advantage of the Liberal Party proposal for Fowler/Werriwa/Hughes/Cook which avoids the splitting of the Liverpool CBD.

Camden LGA

- 10.4 Contrary to the Nationals' objection, the part of Camden LGA which the Redistribution Committee proposes be in Werriwa should not be transferred to Macarthur.
- 10.5 First, that part of Camden LGA has no greater community of interest with, say, Camden (or Campbelltown) than with, say, Liverpool or Ingleburn. Leppington is closer in distance to Liverpool and Ingleburn than to Camden and Campbelltown¹⁸. Travel times between Leppington on the one hand and Liverpool or Ingleburn on the other hand are about the same as travel times between Leppington on the one hand and Camden or Campbelltown on the other hand. Liverpool Hospital is closer to Leppington than is Camden Hospital. There is a direct bus route from Leppington to Liverpool (bus route 857), but there is no direct bus route from Leppington to Campbelltown or Camden¹⁹.
- 10.6 Secondly, the Nationals' proposal would split Leppington from Austral. Both are part of the New South Wales Government's South West Growth strategy²⁰. The New South Wales Government has announced that 9,000 lots will be released in North Leppington. This will raise issues similar to that of Austral (see section 5 above) and the two areas should be kept in the same electorate.

Blairmount, Blair Athol and Woodbine

- 10.7 Blairmount, Blair Athol and Woodbine are best located in Macarthur than in Werriwa.
- 10.8 The data from Google Maps²¹ shows that Blairmount, Blair Athol and Woodbine are each about as far (in distance and travel time) from Ingleburn as from Camden, but considerably closer to Campbelltown than Liverpool:

¹⁸ <http://maps.google.com.au>

¹⁹ www.131500.com.au

²⁰ <http://www.gcc.nsw.gov.au/media/Pdf/2relfs.pdf>

²¹ <http://maps.google.com.au>

| Travel by road to/from | Blairmount | Blair Athol | Woodbine |
|------------------------|-------------------|-------------------|-------------------|
| Liverpool | 24 km; 30 mins | 16 km; 22 mins | 21 km; 24 mins |
| Campbelltown | 5 km; 12 mins | 2 km; 6 mins | 4 km; 10 mins |
| Ingleburn | 12 km; 27 mins | 10 km; 25 mins | 9 km; 22 mins |
| Camden | 15 km; 30 mins | 12 km; 24 mins | 14 km; 28 mins |

11. NATIONALS OBJECTION #5 – CHIFLEY/GREENWAY

11.1 The Liberal Party opposes the suggestions made by the Nationals for the boundary between these Divisions.

12. MISCELLANEOUS OBJECTIONS – NORTH SYDNEY/WARRINGAH

12.1 There were about 40 community objections to the Redistribution Committee's proposed boundary between North Sydney and Warringah, including to the splitting of North Sydney LGA. These concerns can be overcome by adopting the Liberal Party's original proposal for the boundaries between North Sydney, Warringah, Mackellar and Bradfield. This would require no change to the boundaries which the Redistribution Committee proposes for Bennelong or Berowra.

18 September 2009