



Public Suggestion Number 4

Dr Mark Mulcair

11 pages

From: Mark Mulcair [markmulcair@gmail.com]
Sent: Monday, 5 April 2010 2:46 PM
To: VIC Redistribution
Subject: Submission for the Victorian Redistribution 2010
Attachments: Vic 2010.docx

Dear Committee Members,

Please find attached my Submission for the 2010 Victorian Redistribution. If you have any questions or comments regarding my submission, please do not hesitate to contact me.

Regards,

Dr Mark Mulcair

REDISTRIBUTION OF VICTORIA 2010

General Comments:

The enrolment figures show a huge disparity in the growth patterns; extremely strong growth in the outer north-western suburbs, inner Melbourne, and parts of the outer south-east, with very low growth in the inner eastern suburbs and parts of rural Victoria. This disparity does make it difficult to redraw the boundaries while still maintaining the character of existing seats.

Due to the concentration of high and low growth areas, one option is to create a new division in Melbourne's western suburbs, and abolish a seat in the south-east (probably Chisholm), with Melbourne being pushed across the Yarra into South Melbourne. There is some merit in this, but I personally have been unable to make this arrangement work without significant disruption to most seats. Since the areas of explosive growth generally adjoin regions where growth is static, I prefer to allow all existing 37 seats to adjust among themselves.

I have made fairly major changes to seats in Melbourne's outer north and west, where growth is extremely high and significant losses are needed to bring the region within tolerance. Corio moves up the Princes Highway to take in parts of Werribee, and McEwen becomes a more metropolitan division based on Craigieburn and surrounds. I acknowledge that previous redistributions have attempted to emphasise the rural nature of McEwen, but the growth patterns make it almost impossible to retain McEwen as a rural seat at this redistribution.

In rural areas, I have generally been guided by municipal boundaries, and by proposals unite a further four rural shires (Colac-Otway, Northern Grampians, Loddon, Bass Coast), while reducing by one the number of divisions into which Yarra Ranges is split. In Melbourne, I have utilised major roads, rivers, freeways and suburb boundaries wherever possible. Occasionally I have gone beyond what is strictly necessary for quota purposes to achieve a strong, easily identifiable boundary.

VICTORIAN NORTH-WEST

The divisions in rural Victoria are generally slow growing and at the low-end of tolerance, with a few exceptions such as Corangamite. However, transfers from over-quota Lalor and McEwen allows these divisions to expand fairly naturally while generally retaining their existing character.

Wannon needs to gain electors, and one option would be to gain the balance of Northern Grampians Shire from Mallee. However, Mallee is below tolerance, and the loss of even more electors is likely to cause severe flow-on effects to Murray, Indi, Ballarat and Bendigo.

Instead, I suggest Wannon move eastwards, gaining the whole of Colac-Otway Shire from Corangamite, and shedding Northern Grampians and part of Pyrenees (Avoca and surrounds) to bring Mallee up to quota. Stawell and Avoca fit well with towns such as Horsham and St Arnaud that are currently in Mallee.

Corangamite then needs to gain electors from Corio, and the obvious thing to do is gain the remainder of the Bellarine Peninsula, including Drysdale and Clifton Springs. I also suggest Leopold be transferred as well. Leopold bills itself as the “Gateway To The Peninsula”, and would fit well with the remainder of Corangamite.

This gain puts Corangamite slightly outside tolerance, so I suggest the balance of Golden Plains (North West) be transferred to Ballarat. This area is much closer to Ballarat than Geelong and clearly has a strong community of interest with the rest of the division.

Corio then moves northward, gaining around 22,000 electors in Werribee, Werribee South, and Wyndham Vale from Lalor. I suggest the boundary follow the Werribee River, Synot Street, Duncans Road and the Werribee South suburb boundary. The Princes Freeway and south-west railway would be the backbone of the proposed division.

I acknowledge that a Geelong-based division extending into suburban Melbourne is not ideal, but I note the state seat of Lara also extends into Werribee and uses the river as its boundary. Further, any attempt to maintain the Corio/Lalor boundary at Little River causes significant flow-on effects to other rural divisions, with Wannon being forced north into under-quota Mallee.

I also note several individuals and political parties have proposed Corio extend into western Melbourne at previous redistributions.

Ballarat remains within quota after the small gain from Corangamite, and I suggest no further changes.

The gain from Wannon brings **Mallee** within tolerance, and again I suggest no further changes.

Bendigo is predicted to be at the very top end of tolerance, and I recommend it shed the remaining 806 electors in Loddon Shire to Murray. This brings Bendigo closer to quota and unites Loddon in one division.

Murray is well under quota, and needs to gain around 9,000 electors. Realistically, the only possible gain is from Indi, as gaining from McEwen or Bendigo would require the splitting of Mitchell and/or Greater Bendigo.

I suggest Strathbogie Shire be transferred from Indi to Murray. Towns such as Nagambie, Euroa and Violet Town have links to the Murchison/Shepparton region, currently within Murray. Nagambie in particular has very strong links to Murchison/Shepparton via the Goulburn Valley Highway and Shepparton rail line.

Indi, with this loss, gains Murrindindi Shire from McEwen. Alexandria, Eildon and Yea all have connections to the Mansfield and High Country region, and the Maroondah and Melba Highways would be strong links throughout the southern part of the division. This arrangement also has the advantage of making Indi's southern boundary the main mountain range, which is a clear and obvious divide.

Unfortunately it is not possible to unite Moira Shire in Murray, as removing these electors from Indi would cause the division to fall outside tolerance.

MELBOURNE NORTH-WEST

This region contains most of the strongest growth in Victoria; however the aforementioned transfers to rural Victoria and some pockets of low growth allow the divisions here to self-adjust. The adjoining divisions of McEwen, Calwell, Gorton and Lalor undergo fairly large change to keep their growth under control, while the under-quota Maribyrnong, Batman and Scullin can expand to absorb the excess from other divisions.

McEwen requires significant change. In addition to the loss of Murrindindi, it loses its share of Yarra Ranges Shire to Casey (to compensate the low-growth divisions in Melbourne's east), and 12,000 electors in Whittlesea council to under-quota Scullin. This leaves it needing around 20,000 electors to be brought within tolerance.

Rather than a split of the Craigieburn/Roxburgh Park area, I suggest the best way to achieve tolerance is to transfer the bulk of Hume (Craigieburn) from Calwell; including Craigieburn, Roxburgh Park, Greenvale, Mickleham, and Yuroke. My proposed southern boundary follows Cooper Street, Somerton Road, the Greenvale suburb boundary, Mickleham Road, Moonee Ponds Creek, Sunbury Road, Wildwood Road, and Deep Creek. Melbourne Airport, Bulla, and the balance of Atwood remain in Calwell.

In exchange, McEwen sheds its share of Macedon Ranges Shire to Calwell. This area has almost no connection to the rest of McEwen, and a number of Suggestions and Objections at the previous redistribution highlighted the region's much stronger links with Sunbury. The result is a net transfer of around 20,000 electors from Calwell to McEwen.

I acknowledge that previous redistributions have emphasised the rural nature of McEwen, and that my changes to McEwen are greater than what are strictly necessary for quota purposes. However, the combination of explosive growth in Melbourne's north-west and the static nature of rural Victoria make it inevitable McEwen will become more urbanised.

While the number of transferred electors is quite large, my proposed McEwen is far more focussed than the existing division; an urban/semi-rural seat linking the outer northern suburbs with the satellite communities of Mitchell, Whittlesea and Nillumbik Shires.

The exchange with McEwen leaves **Calwell** under quota, and I recommend it moving westwards to regain part of the territory it lost in the previous redistribution. I suggest transferring all of Gorton north of the Melton Highway, plus Diggers Rest from Lalor, to Calwell. Diggers Rest has far stronger connections to Sunbury and the Sydenham area than to Werribee and Melton, and fits well with Calwell.

Gorton remains outside tolerance despite the losses to Calwell, and can transfer further electors to under-quota Maribyrnong. A very neat way to achieve tolerance is to move the boundary around Sunshine from Kororoit Creek to the Western Ring Road, transferring Sunshine West and Ardeer to Maribyrnong. I recommend using the Ring Road as far as the Brimbank Council boundary (Boundary Road), then following this to the existing boundary at Kororoit Creek.

Despite the losses to Corio and Calwell, **Lalor** remains outside tolerance, and needs to lose a further 3,000 or so electors. The obvious thing to do is transfer the balance of Hobsons Bay Council to Gellibrand, uniting the Laverton area in that division. I note that there is a case for removing Melton Shire from Lalor, since it has few links with Werribee, but this causes too many flow-on effects to Gellibrand, Maribyrnong, and Gorton.

Uniting Hobsons Bay puts **Gellibrand** at the very top of tolerance, but given its strong boundaries, I do not feel any further changes are warranted.

Maribyrnong's gains bring it within tolerance, but I also recommend it gain that part of Strathmore south of the Tullamarine Freeway from Wills. The freeway and Moonee Ponds Creek are much clearer and more obvious boundaries in the area than Bulla Road and Woodland Avenue.

This loss allows **Wills** to gain the remainder of Moreland from Melbourne, uniting Brunswick within the one division and providing a clearer northern boundary for Melbourne. East of Nicholson Street, the municipal boundary follows very minor streets, so I suggest continuing the boundary east along Park Street to the railway line and Merri Creek. This places a small part of Yarra council in Wills, but results in a much clearer boundary.

Note that Wills cannot accept these electors from Melbourne without the above loss to Maribyrnong.

Despite this loss, **Melbourne** is still over quota, and the only realistic option is to lose electors to Batman in the north-east.

An obvious transfer is the remainder of Alphington which, despite being in Yarra Council, has no connection to the rest of Melbourne (and was objected to at the last redistribution). I also suggest that around 3,000 electors in Clifton Hill (east of Hoddle Street and north of the Eastern Freeway) be placed in Batman. While splitting Clifton Hill is not ideal, these two roads are strong and clear boundaries, and the area has links to the remainder of Batman through two rail lines and two major roads.

While this gain brings **Batman** within tolerance, I recommend Batman also make a gain from Scullin, moving the boundary north to the Ring Road. This is a very clear and obvious boundary compared to the existing council boundary, particularly east of High Street.

Jagajaga also makes a gain from Scullin by utilising the Greensborough Highway/Greensborough Bypass as the boundary, uniting central Greensborough in Jagajaga. The Bypass is a much clearer boundary than the current “dog-leg” through the centre of Greensborough. Unfortunately it is not possible to transfer the balance of Banyule to Jagajaga without pushing the division outside tolerance.

Scullin's losses combined with its low enrolment requires a gain of around 12,000 electors, and the only place it can make this gain is from McEwen. An obvious solution is to move the boundary north to Bridge Inn Road, placing more of the rapidly-developing South Morang and Mernda areas in Scullin, and giving that division a strong growth base.

MELBOURNE SOUTH-EAST

This region (especially the east and inner south-eastern suburbs) is characterised by particularly low growth, so much so that thought might be given to abolishing a division in this area. However, by transferring Yarra Ranges electors from McEwen to Casey, I am able to retain all existing divisions. Casey's new excess compensates its low-growth neighbours, which generally move south and east to gain electors.

Kooyong has strong western, northern and eastern boundaries, so can only make gains from Higgins in the south. I suggest extending the boundary along Gardiners Creek to High Street, then following Glen Iris Road to Toorak Road. This transfers the balance of Camberwell and parts of Glen Iris to Kooyong.

Higgins can then move its southern boundary to North Road (between Grange Road and Poath Road), gaining around 13,000 electors from Goldstein and Hotham, and uniting Carnegie and Murrumbeena in one division. Although not necessary for quota, I suggest the 1500 Monash electors in Higgins be placed in Hotham, to reduce the number of electorates into which Oakleigh is split.

Melbourne Ports can be easily brought within tolerance by shedding the remainder of the suburb of Caulfield South to Goldstein, utilising Kooyong Road as the new boundary.

These changes leave **Goldstein** under quota, and I suggest it gain from Hotham by moving the boundary from Tucker Road to (appropriately) East Boundary Road. Around 5,700 electors in Bentleigh East are transferred. While there is a case for expanding southwards along the coast into Isaacs, I am unable to find a way to do this without making a messy split of Mentone.

Chisholm is well under quota and needs a significant gain. Since it is already an elongated north-south division, I do not recommend extending it any further north or south, so any gains must be made from Deakin to the east.

The existing eastern boundary of Chisholm at different times follows Middleborough Road, Blackburn Road, and Springvale Road, making a number of deviations and splitting the major centre of Glen Waverley. The low enrolment and slow growth in neighbouring Bruce and Deakin is also a consideration.

I suggest adopting Blackburn Road alone as the eastern boundary for Chisholm, gaining around 17,500 electors in Blackburn and Burwood East from Deakin, and shedding the balance of Glen Waverley to Bruce. Through Blackburn, the boundary would follow Surrey Road, Whitehorse Road, Chapel Street, Railway Avenue, and Blackburn Road. While this would split Blackburn, the bulk of the main shopping centre plus the railway station would be united in Chisholm, and the boundary through the area would be clear and obvious.

The gain from Chisholm brings **Bruce** within tolerance, uniting Glen Waverley in the one division, and no further changes are needed.

Menzies also requires a gain from Deakin. Since two fragments of the boundary with Deakin follow Mullum Mullum Creek, the easiest solution is simply to join them up, utilising the creek for the entire southern boundary. Around 7,200 electors in Ringwood and Ringwood North are transferred.

Deakin, with losses to Chisholm and Menzies, requires about 30,000 electors to achieve tolerance. Firstly, I suggest the part of Whitehorse City within Aston be placed in Deakin, uniting Forest Hill and Vermont in the one division. This area has far greater connection to Deakin than Aston, and the Dandenong Creek (surrounded by parkland for much of its length) is a strong boundary.

Deakin also moves its boundary with Casey east to Dorset Road, Exeter Road, Lyons Road, the municipal boundary and the Croydon Hills suburb boundary. Croydon Hills and large parts of Croydon, Croydon South and Bayswater North are gained from Casey. All of these areas fit well with the existing Deakin.

Casey's losses are then compensated by the gain of McEwen's share of Yarra Ranges Shire. The Yarra Valley region has strong links to Lilydale and surrounds, with connections via the Maroondah, Melba, and Warburton Highways. I note that Suggestions and Comments at previous redistributions have recommended uniting the Yarra Valley within Casey.

Aston can naturally expand south-east into Latrobe, gaining more of Boronia, Bayswater and Ferntree Gully. These areas are all in Knox council and arguably have stronger links to Aston than to the bulk of Latrobe. I suggest the boundary continue along Dandenong Creek to Liverpool Road, then follow Miller Road, Albert Avenue, Boronia Road, and Dorset Road to the existing boundary. Approximately 16,000 electors are gained from Latrobe.

Hotham can be neatly compensated for its losses to Goldstein and Higgins by gaining Keysborough from Isaacs, adopting Cheltenham Road and Eastlink as the boundary. This straightens the boundary and provides a neater split of the area than the relatively minor roads used as the existing boundary.

I also suggest an adjustment around Moorabbin Airport. The existing Hotham/Isaacs boundary in the area follows an old municipal boundary, but east of Warrigal Road this uses very minor local streets. I recommend the boundary be straightened to run along Centre Dandenong Road and Boundary Road, transferring around 2000 electors from Hotham to Isaacs.

OUTER SOUTH-EAST AND GIPPSLAND

Parts of the outer south-east are experiencing extremely high growth, but the losses to Aston and Hotham make this region self-adjusting. I have tried to provide a better spread of the rapidly growing Narre Warren, Cranbourne, and Pakenham areas across three divisions (Holt, Latrobe, and McMillan) instead of the current two.

The losses to Hotham require **Isaacs** to gain electors. Since it has a strong eastern boundary with Holt, I suggest it move south-west into Dunkley, gaining around 7,000 electors in the Seaford area by straightening the boundary along Ballarto and Seaford Roads.

Dunkley then pushes further south to gain Mount Martha and surrounds from Flinders. Growth around Mount Martha and Mornington has effectively made these two communities a single urban centre, and it is logical to unite the area in one division. The neatest way to do this is to simply follow the Mount Martha suburb boundary along Moorooduc Highway, Mornington Peninsula Freeway, and Bruce Road.

This loss puts **Flinders** outside tolerance, but it can easily be brought up to quota by gaining the balance of Bass Coast Shire from McMillan. This unites the Shire in Flinders and links Wonthaggi and Inverloch with Phillip Island and other Bass Coast communities.

Holt, well over quota, sheds around 22,000 electors to LaTrobe by moving its eastern boundary from Clyde Road back to Narre Warren-Cranbourne Road and Ballarto Road. Further parts of Narre Warren, Cranbourne North, and Cranbourne East are transferred.

The exchanges with Aston and Holt leave **LaTrobe** well over quota, so I recommend it lose all of Cardinia-Pakenham (Officer and surrounds) to McMillan. Officer has strong links to Pakenham and those parts of Cardinia Shire already in McMillan. The rapidly growing areas west of Pakenham are now placed in a low-growth division, providing it with a strong population base.

This gain compensates **McMillan** for the loss of Bass Coast, and no further changes are needed. McMillan remains a division centred on West Gippsland and the Princes Highway corridor.

Gippsland has robust growth and remains well within tolerance. Given its strong boundaries and clear identity as an East Gippsland division, I recommend no changes be made.

POLITICAL IMPLICATIONS

The political impact of redistributions certainly attracts a lot of discussion for something that's not supposed to be discussed. It's inevitable that Submissions will be judged along political lines, so I note that my proposals don't seem to unfairly advantage either party.

The ALP would obviously receive a big advantage in McEwen at the expense of their margin in Calwell, and seem favoured in Corangamite, Aston, and possibly Casey. The Liberals would gain a clear benefit in Deakin and Dunkley, and probably also get a boost in Chisholm, Bruce, Latrobe and McMillan.

WANNON

Existing	96331
-Northern Gramp	6267
- Avoca	2441
+ Colac/Otway	15608
	103231

CORANGAMITE

Existing	106034
- Colac/Otway	15608
+ Drys/Clifton/Leo	15183
- Golden P (NW)	1904
	103705

CORIO

Existing	95139
- Drys/Clifton/Leo	15183
+ Werribee/Wer S	21694
	101650

MALLEE

Existing	91721
+ N Gramp/Avoca	8708
	100429

BENDIGO

Existing	104772
- Loddon	806
	103966

MURRAY

Existing	92402
+ Loddon	806
+ Strathbogie	7683
	100891

INDI

Existing	95386
- Strathbogie	7683
+ Murrindindi	10312
	98015

McEWEN

Existing	122829
- Murrindindi	10312
- Yarra Ranges	20610
- South Morang	12279
- Macedon Ranges	23225
+ Hume (Craigie)	44731
	101134

CALWELL

Existing	109034
- Hume (Craigie)	44731
+ Macedon Ranges	23225
+ (from Gorton)	13961
+ Diggers Rest	1147
	102636

GORTON

Existing	126751
- (to Calwell)	13961
- Ardeer/Sun W	12034
	100756

MARIBYRNONG

Existing	88363
+ Ardeer/Sun W	12034
+ Strathmore	3801
	104198

LALOR

Existing	129351
- Werribee/Wer S	21694
- Diggers Rest	1147
- Hobsons Bay	2544
	103966

GELLIBRAND

Existing	102248
+ Hobsons Bay	2544
	104792

WILLS

Existing	102337
- Strathmore	3801
+ Moreland/Yarra	5770
	104306

MELBOURNE

Existing	112694
- Moreland/Yarra	5770
- Alph/Clifton H	4589
	102335

BATMAN

Existing	93702
+ Alph/Clifton H	4589
+ (from Scullin)	4450
	102741

JAGAJAGA

Existing	96909
+ Greensborough	1421
	98330

SCULLIN

Existing	94598
- (to Batman)	4450
- Greensborough	1421
+ South Morang	12276
	101003

CASEY

Existing	95903
+ Yarra Ranges	20610
- Croydon	16526
99987	

DEAKIN

Existing	90731
- Blackburn	17493
- Ringwood Nth	7298
+ Croydon	16526
+ Forest/Vermont	16088
98554	

CHISHOLM

Existing	91635
+ Blackburn	17435
- Glen Waverley	8107
100963	

BRUCE

Existing	91795
+ Glen Waverley	8107
99902	

ASTON

Existing	98260
- Forest/Vermont	16088
+ Boronia/Bays	16101
98273	

LATROBE

Existing	105726
- Boronia/Bays	16101
+ Narre W/Cran	22882
- Pak/Officer	10879
101628	

MENZIES

Existing	92932
+ Ringwood Nth	7298
100230	

MELBOURNE PORTS

Existing	107152
- Caulfield Sth	4805
102347	

GOLDSTEIN

Existing	97749
- Carnegie	5115
+ Caulfield Sth	4805
+ Bentleigh East	5770
103209	

KOOYONG

Existing	92078
+ Camberwell/G.Iris	8078
100156	

HIGGINS

Existing	95284
- Camberwell/G.Iris	8078
- Oakleigh	1579
+ Murrumbeena	8096
+ Carnegie	5115
98838	

HOTHAM

Existing	93256
- Murrumbeena	8096
- Bentleigh East	5770
- Moorabbin Airport	2598
+ Oakleigh	1579
+ Keysborough	20703
99074	

ISAACS

Existing	109577
- Keysborough	20703
+ Moorabbin Airport	2598
+ Seaford	6767
98239	

HOLT

Existing	121943
- Narre W/Cran	22882
99061	

DUNKLEY

Existing	97784
- Seaford	6767
+ Mt Matha	11872
102889	

FLINDERS

Existing	102669
- Mount Martha	11872
+ Bass Coast	9430
100227	

McMILLAN

- Bass Coast	9430
+ Pak/Officer	10879
98762	

GIPPSLAND

Existing	102038
----------	---------------