



The Federal Redistribution 2006
NEW SOUTH WALES



Public Objection Number: 1953

Name: Australian Labor Party (NSW Branch)

Page(s): 20

28 July 2006

Augmented Redistribution Commission
for New South Wales
Level 4, Roden Cutler House
24 Campbell Street
HAYMARKET NSW 2000

Dear Commissioners,

Please find attached the Australian Labor Party (NSW Branch) objections to the Commissioners proposals.

Yours sincerely,

A handwritten signature in black ink, appearing to read 'Mark Arbib', written in a cursive style.

Mark Arbib
GENERAL SECRETARY

AUSTRALIAN LABOR PARTY OBJECTIONS TO PROPOSED NSW DIVISIONAL BOUNDARIES

The Australian Labor Party (New South Wales Branch) hereby lodges six separate Appeals involving the proposed boundaries of 17 Divisions.

At all times our numbers refer to those at the projected date in May, 2010. Also we have provided CCD movements that would result from our appeal so as to provide as much information to allow anyone with an interest to better understand what we are seeking.

The ALP's objection has made use of the EBMS system and the changes we are proposing on EBMS format is also provided for the Commissioners as part of our Objections.

In each Objection, the ALP provides a summary of both the effects of and reasons for our Objections.

The Commissioners have proposed boundaries in many regions significantly different to any suggestions made.

At the same time we acknowledge that these Commissioners have been prepared via their Report to both explain their thinking and approach as well as giving reasons for proposed movements by Division.

Neither the Labor or Liberal Parties suggested that Macquarie's boundary be moved westward to reincorporate areas that had been in Macquarie from Federation until 1977. Yet by trying to retain the Blue Mountains as a western boundary of Macquarie, the ALP's suggestions ended up having Goulburn placed in Eden Monaro and a Bowral-Shellharbour Division. We weren't able to do other than to divide the Southern Highlands. The Liberals ended up jumping the Georges River and tried to put a major part of Bankstown into Hughes which since its creation in 1955 has always been a Sutherland- Liverpool or Sutherland-Wollongong Division.

The Commissioners avoided our problems by being prepared to extend Macquarie to Bathurst. The Commissioners are also correct in noting the linkages via the Great Western, Hume and New England Highways. Nevertheless, it is our opinion they are incorrect in assuming a linkage across the Snowy.

We think the other major flaw in what the Commissioners proposed was the treatment of Parramatta.

Yet we are confident that our appeal to correct Eden Monaro which affects five Divisions actually produces in each case better boundaries on community of interest grounds.

We say the same regarding our appeal to the seat of Parramatta, involving four Divisions.

Of our four other appeals, three involve small changes ranging from fewer than 200 electors to just under 2000 electors. These might be fairly described as fine tuning and don't attempt in any significant way to overturn the Commissioner's proposals. The remaining appeal suggests a better arrangement for Bankstown, but largely confining our changes to the Divisions of Banks and Blaxland.

Finally, we wish to comment on the complaints of the National Party and others concerning the proposed abolition of Gwydir.

The best that can be said for the National's effort is that they've added luster to the old adage about self interest masquerading as principle. For example, self interest, as has been pointed out by the MP for Murray Darling, did not stop the Nationals suggesting that the State Seat cover more than 40% of the State, a proposal made by the Nationals in 1998 which was adopted.

The inland country was significantly short of electors. The Commissioners movement of Macquarie west only determined the location of the inland Division to be abolished, not its event.

Also, we now have Macquarie with a rural component with strong links back to the Mountains, a Hunter with a stronger rural component and Hume more of a rural Division than previously.

Hume would also become under the ALP Objections an even more rural focused Division.

ALP APPEAL No. 1:
DIVISIONS OF EDEN MONARO; GILMORE; HUME; FARRER AND RIVERINA

Effect of ALP Appeal: Retains the Snowy Mountains as the western boundary of Eden Monaro, a boundary continuous since Federation; restores Tumbarumba to Farrer; enables Hay and Murrumbidgee LGA to stay in Riverina; keeps in Gilmore the part of the Wingecarribee LGA proposed to be transferred out; produces a cleaner boundary between Gilmore and Eden Monaro.

Reasons for ALP Objection:

1. In their report the Commissioners note that the need for Farrer to lose electors, triggered by the gain of Broken Hill in turn allowed the Commissioners to move both Tumut and Tumbarumba into the Division of Eden Monaro, thereby uniting the Snowy Mountains communities on both sides of the Great Dividing Range.
2. Elsewhere in their report, the Commissioners suggested that improvements in transport and communications had lessened the significance of previous barriers and arrangements.
3. Moreover, the Commissioners cited the Great Western Highway and Railway as providing a strong connection between communities on both sides of the Divide.
4. We agree with this. As well, we think similar arguments can be made regarding, say, the Hume Highway or the New England Highway.
5. However, there is no case to suggest that the Snowy has any significant road links between the communities on the other side. Indeed the steepness of the slope and iciness of the road in winter makes this a rarely covered track.
6. Indeed the communities on either side of the Snowy look everywhere except to each other. These are communities who continue to regard the Snowy as a barrier and not a connection between themselves.
7. Eden Monaro is a Federation Division. For its 105 year history, the Snowy has been a boundary. That arrangement should stay.
8. Eden Monaro had to lose about 7000 electors to bring it down to quota. Yet the Commissioners take out 17000 and put 10,000 (Tumut and Tumbarumba) back in even though those communities have few connections.
9. Tumbarumba strongly looks to Albury and it has been in the Albury based Farrer since its creation in 1949. We put it back in.

10. This then allows Farrer to return both Hay and Murrumbidgee LGA's to Riverina. The MIA core LGA's are Griffith, Leeton, Narrandera and Murrumbidgee. They've always been in the same Federal Division. We keep these LGA's intact in Riverina.
11. The above changes enable Riverina to shed to Hume Gundagai LGA. This as well as Tumut which we also transfer to Hume have usually been in that seat. Indeed Tumut has only ever been part of an Albury based seat since 2001.
12. Hume then gives back to Gilmore all that part of Wingecarribee LGA currently in Gilmore but proposed by the Commissioners to go to Hume. The ALP appeal retains the status quo in the boundary between Hume and Gilmore which has existed since 1991.
13. Bateman's Bay then becomes the boundary between Gilmore and Eden Monaro.
14. Overall, the ALP's appeal significantly reduces the movement of electors between the above Divisions than the Commissioners and the ALP has produced far better Community of Interest arrangements.

<u>DIVISION</u>	<u>Commissioner's Proj</u>
<u>1. EDEN MONARO</u>	<u>93941</u>
<u>Less</u> Tumut LGA (part)	-15 <u>To Hume</u>
<u>Less</u> Tumut LGA (part)	-7740 <u>To Hume</u>
<u>Less</u> Tumbarumba LGA	-2348 <u>To Farrer</u>
<u>Plus</u> Eurobodella LGA (part) That part south of Batesmans Bay CCD's 181702, 5 181801-11; 181902-4, 8; 182001, 2, 11; 182601-11.	+10958 <u>Ex Gilmore</u>
<u>TOTAL</u>	<u>94796</u>

5. RIVERINA

93734

Less Gundagai LGA

- 2699 To Hume

Plus Hay LGA

+ 2355 Ex Farrer

Less Murrumbidgee LGA

+ 1633 Ex Farrer

TOTAL

95023

ALP APPEAL No. 2:
DIVISIONS OF PARRAMATTA, REID, GREENWAY AND MITCHELL

Effect of ALP Appeal: Restores Parramatta to the Division of Parramatta; provides clearer boundaries and more consolidates communities than the Commissioners proposals.

Reasons for ALP Objection:

1. The proposed division of Parramatta excludes some very significant locations and sites that are important to the area. Some of these sites are important not only to the Parramatta region but to the history of the rest of the state as well.
 - These sites include;
 - Parramatta CBD
 - Parramatta Town Hall
 - Westfield Parramatta
 - Parramatta Train Station
 - Parramatta Park
 - Government House Parramatta
 - The Crescent – Parramatta Park (Location of the first successful crop in Parramatta)
 - St Patrick’s Cathedral – Parramatta Diocese
 - Parramatta Golf Course
 - Parramatta Ferry Wharf
 - Parramatta Police Station
 - Old Parramatta Hospital Site (Parramatta Legal Precinct – Under construction)
 - Elizabeth Farm – Parramatta’s first farm
 - Parramatta High School
 - Lancer Barracks – Parramatta’s and one of NSW’s oldest active Regiments
 - University of Western Sydney – Parramatta Campus

These sites form the heart of the community of Parramatta and therefore should be included in the proposed division of Parramatta.

1. Moreover, the proposals split Wentworthville, remove the core inner Parramatta suburbs of Westmead and Harris Park.
2. Under the ALP appeal the Division of Parramatta is not only able to contain the core parts of Parramatta in Parramatta but is also able to not only retain the parts of Blacktown LGA proposed but is also able to better consolidate these suburbs.

3. The ALP's objection provides far clearer boundaries for electors with far less division of communities.
4. For example, the boundary between Parramatta and Reid becomes Pennant Hills Rd, Church St, Victoria St and James Ruse Drive; Pennant Hills Rd also becomes the boundary between Reid and Mitchell.
5. From Greenway, Parramatta gains the suburb of Glenwood which is bounded by Sunnyholt Rd. That boundary contains a significant road which also marks a boundary between the relatively older and more recently developed suburbs of Blacktown. The boundary as we suggest here has also been used as a State Electoral boundary in recent times.
6. Greenway then picks up Box Hill and Rouse Hill from Mitchell. Under our arrangement, the suburbs of Rouse and Rouse Hill which are in different Divisions would be put together.
7. Under the objection Carlingford would be transferred from Parramatta to the Division of Mitchell. But Carlingford is part of Baulkham Hills LGA which is head quartered at Castle Hill, itself in the Division of Mitchell. Elsewhere we simply restore back to Mitchell those parts of Baulkham Hills LGA that had been proposed to go to Parramatta.

DIVISION

Commissioner's Proj

1. PARRAMATTA

95327

Less part of Baulkham Hills LGA
South of Pennant Hills Road
CCD's 261209-12

- 2532 To Reid

Less remainder of Baulkham
Hills LGA

-12248 To Mitchell

Less that part of Parramatta LGA south
of Pennant Hills Road
CCD's 330801-12;
333001-9, 11;
330903-5.

-9365 To Reid

Less part Parramatta LGA (that part
south east of Pennant Hills Rd, east of
Church St and north of Victoria Rd)
CCD's 1330504B, 9
1330701, 2, 5B, 10.

- 4228 To Reid

1332901A, 5, 7, 8.

Plus part Holroyd LGA
(all that part proposed by the Commissioners to be transferred from Parramatta to Reid) + 6358 Ex Reid

Plus part Parramatta LGA +10810 Ex Reid
(That part east of James Ruse Drive Proposed by the Commissioners to be Transferred from Parramatta to Reid
CCD's 330601-11;
3300506;
331301-12;
330703-5, 11;
332901-4, 6, 9.

NB the CCD 1331310 has been split at James Ruse Drive with all electors (151) allocated to the western (Parramatta) end.

Plus part Blacktown North + 9573 Ex Greenway
(all that south and east of Sunnyholt Rd)
CCD's 1271811, 13, 14
1272901-2; 11-17.

TOTAL **93695**

2. REID **93478**

Less part Holroyd LGA
(all that part proposed by the Commissioners to be transferred from Parramatta to Reid) - 6358 To Parramatta

Less part Parramatta LGA -10810 To Parramatta
(That part east of James Ruse Drive Proposed by the Commissioners to be Transferred from Parramatta to Reid
CCD's 330601-11;
3300506;
331301-12;
330703-5, 11;
332901-4, 6, 9.

NB the CCD 1331310 has been split at James Ruse Drive with all electors (151) allocated to the western (Parramatta) end.

Plus part of Baulkham Hills LGA + 2532 Ex Parramatta
South of Pennant Hills Road
CCD's 261209-12

Plus part Parramatta LGA (that part
south east of Pennant Hills Rd, east of
Church St and north of Victoria Rd)
CCD's 1330504B, 9 + 4228 Ex Parramatta
1330701, 2, 5B, 10.
1332901A, 5, 7, 8.

Plus that part of Parramatta LGA south
of Pennant Hills Road +9365 Ex Parramatta
CCD's 330801-12;
333001-9, 11;
330903-5.

TOTAL **92435**

3. GREENWAY **92294**

Less part Blacktown North - 9573 To Parramatta
(all that south and east of Sunnyholt Rd)
CCD's 1271811, 13, 14
1272901-2; 11-17.

Plus part Baulkham Hills LGA + 12460 Ex Mitchell
(part including Box Hill
And Rouse Hill)
CCD's 260202-3, 9-10.
260301, 12, 18-24.

TOTAL **95181**

4. MITCHELL **92871**

Less part Baulkham Hills LGA -12460 To Greenway
(part including Box Hill
And Rouse Hill)
CCD's 260202-3, 9-10.
260301, 12, 18-24.

Plus part Baulkham Hills LGA +12248 Ex Parramatta
(all except that part (2532 in this appeal, see above) that would be transferred to
Reid

TOTAL

92659

ALP APPEAL No3: Divisions of Banks, Blaxland and Watson

Effect of ALP Appeal: Places the northern and southern parts of Bankstown CBD into the same Division (Blaxland)

Reasons for ALP Objection:

1. Under the ALP appeal the only change to Watson is the loss of fewer than 1500 electors to Banks. Watson remains within the tolerance.
2. Our main purpose is to unite Bankstown. In so doing we also are able to retain nearly 14000 electors in Blaxland who under the Commissioners proposals would be transferred to Banks.
3. At the same time we make Stacy St, a major and identifiable landmark as a boundary between Blaxland and Reid.
4. We are also able to retain Canterbury Rd as a boundary between Banks and Blaxland.
5. Also the northern boundary of Banks which, under our objection would be Rawson St, is the current boundary between the State Electoral Districts of Bankstown and Auburn.

DIVISION

Commissioner's Proj

1. WATSON

93336

Less part Canterbury LGA
Part south east of Punchbowl Rd
CCD's 350201, 2, 6, 12.

- 1489 To Banks

TOTAL

91847

2. BANKS

92563

Less part Bankstown LGA
That part west of Stacy St
Proposed by the Commissioners
To be transferred to Banks

- 13725 To Blaxland

Plus part Bankstown LGA
That part east of Stacy St, Hume
Highway and South of Rawson Road

+ 11851 Ex Blaxland

Plus part Canterbury LGA
Part south east of Punchbowl Rd
CCD's 350201, 2, 6, 12. + 1489 Ex Watson

TOTAL **92178**

3. BLAXLAND **92624**

Less part Bankstown LGA
That part east of Stacy St, Hume
Highway and South of Rawson Road - 11851 To Banks
Plus part Bankstown LGA
That part west of Stacy St + 13725 Ex Banks
Proposed by the Commissioners
To be transferred to Banks

TOTAL **94498**

ALP APPEAL No. 4:
Divisions of Lowe, Blaxland and Reid

Effect of ALP Appeal: Unites all of Strathfield LGA in Lowe.

Reasons for ALP Objection:

1. Strathfield LGA contains almost 20,000 electors of whom around 80% currently live in Lowe.
2. The Commissioners proposals if adopted would mean that 94% of the electors of Strathfield LGA would be in Lowe.
3. The ALP proposes that the remaining 1181 (projected) Strathfield LGA electors be transferred from both Blaxland and Reid to Lowe.
4. Under the Commissioners proposals, Lowe is projected to contain 90753 electors. The addition to Lowe of 1181 electors would still leave that Division with a projected enrolment below the State average.
5. No compensating movement is required of either Reid or Blaxland once the Strathfield LGA electors are transferred from these Divisions to Lowe.
6. Under the Commissioners proposals Homebush West would be split between three Divisions.
7. Although the Commissioners Blaxland has only 739 electors from Strathfield LGA, these are in two separate pockets of the Division.
8. For the above reasons the ALP believes any potential voter confusion arising from the Commissioners proposals would be eliminated by consolidating all of Strathfield LGA in one Division. This completes the logic of what the Commissioners have started.

DIVISION

Commissioner's Proj

1. LOWE

90753

Plus part Strathfield LGA
All that is proposed to be in
Blaxland

+ 739 Ex Blaxland

Plus part Strathfield LGA
All that is proposed to be in
Reid

+ 442 Ex Reid

Plus part Canada A- Concord (part) +0 Ex Reid

TOTAL **91934**

2. BLAXLAND **94498***

Less part Strathfield LGA - 739 To Lowe
All that is proposed to be in
Blaxland

TOTAL **93759***

Based on ALP Appeal No. 3 (as above) being upheld. Were that Appeal not to be upheld then Blaxland would start at the Commissioners proposed 92624 and then become 91885 should the Commissioners agree to place all of Strathfield LGA in Lowe.

3. REID **92435 ***

Less part Strathfield LGA - 442 To Lowe
All that is proposed to be in
Reid

TOTAL **91933***

Based on ALP Appeal No. 3 (as above) being upheld. Were that Appeal not to be upheld then Reid would start at the Commissioners proposed 93478 and then become 93036 should the Commissioners agree to place all of Strathfield LGA in Lowe.

ALP APPEAL No.5: DIVISIONS OF BENNELONG AND BEROWRA

Effect of ALP Appeal: Upholds the principle that where no change is required then Section 66(3) (b) (v) — “the boundaries of existing Divisions....” Should apply unless the Commissioners think their proposals give greater effect to the other Community of Interest criteria they must consider.

Reasons for ALP Objection:

1. The Commissioners have proposed that in order for Bennelong to achieve statistical tolerance that it receives two parcels of electors from adjoining Divisions. These are 5591 electors from Ermington in the Division of Parramatta and 1984 from Beecroft in the Division of Berowra.
2. The ALP agrees with the proposal to move Ermington to Bennelong. The proposal to also use Silverwater Rd as the new south western boundary between Bennelong and Parramatta clearly successfully meets the community of Interest considerations.
3. The addition of 5591 electors into Bennelong would bring this Division to within 1% of the projected average Divisional number.
4. The further addition of electors (Beecroft) to Bennelong is unnecessary.
5. Under the Commissioners proposals, Berowra is around 2.5% below the projected average. If the electors in Beecroft remain in Bradfield instead of being transferred to Bennelong then Bradfield becomes within 0.4% of the projected average with Bennelong, as stated before within 1%.
6. The M2 Motorway, is a recent feature and unlike many older significant roads, cuts across communities.
7. Parramatta Road, our oldest main thoroughfare, is the example of a road around which communities developed. Often across its length Parramatta Road is also a cutoff point between communities.
8. No existing community arrangements were affected by the M2.
9. Under the Commissioners proposals the suburb of Beecroft would remain divided (as now).
10. There are no clear reasons why the existing boundary should be altered on both numerical and Community of Interest grounds.

DIVISION

Commissioner's Proj

1. BENNELONG

94606

Less part Hornsby LGA
(all that part proposed by
the Commissioners to be transferred
from Berowra.)

- 1984 To Berowra

TOTAL

92622

2. BEROWRA

91226

Plus part Hornsby LGA
(all that part proposed by
the Commissioners to be transferred
from Berowra to Bennelong.)

+ 1984 Ex Bennelong

TOTAL

93210

ALP APPEAL No. 6: DIVISIONS OF WENTWORTH AND SYDNEY

Effect of ALP Appeal: Provides an even clearer boundary between these Divisions.

Reasons for ALP Objection:

1. The ALP believes that the Commissioners proposed utilization of Hyde Park and the Domain as a boundary at the Northern end of Sydney between that Division and Wentworth is a clear and perfectly understandable boundary.
2. We had suggested another area (Surry Hills and Darlinghurst) be transferred from Sydney to Wentworth. However we accept that there are very solid grounds for the Commissioners proposals in this area. For example, under the Commissioners proposals the entire southern side of the Harbor east of the CBD would be in Wentworth. Hence, we see no grounds to appeal these proposals.
3. The Commissioners proposals have South Dowling St as the south western boundary between Wentworth and Sydney. Again, this is a clear boundary.
4. However, a slight adjustment involving fewer than 200 electors would make the boundary even clearer.
5. Under the ALP appeal Sydney would lose to Wentworth a small triangle tipped at the point where South Dowling St and Flinders St join and bound by those streets to the eastern side of Oxford St at Taylor Square.
6. This is where South Dowling St continues into Flinders St as a six lane main road taking, for example, all buses to the city. At this point South Dowling St, although still busy becomes a lesser, four lane road before it ends at Oxford St.
7. Under the ALP Appeal, anyone standing at Taylor Square, through which all buses flow through Finders St on the way to South Dowling St, would know that on the eastern and northern sides he'd be in Wentworth and on the western and southern sides he's in Sydney.

DIVISION

Commissioner's Proj

1. WENTWORTH

95224

Plus part Sydney City LGA
That part bounded by Oxford,
Flinders and South Dowling Sts.

+ 190 Ex Sydney

CCD's 401103, 4, 4A.

TOTAL

95414

2. SYDNEY

93291

Less part Sydney City LGA
That part bounded by Oxford,
Flinders and South Dowling Sts.
CCD's 401103, 4, 4A

- 190 To Wentworth

TOTAL

93101